SECTION 1 OF 3 BUENOS AIRES 2234

E.O. 11652: GDS
TAGS: SHUM, PINS, AR
SUBJECT: THE PROBLEM OF THOSE WHO DISAPPEARED

1. SUMMARY:
WITH THE PUBLICATION OF THE FINAL LISTS OF PRISONERS HELD BY THE EXECUTIVE UNDER THE STATE OF SEIGE POWER, MANY IN ARGENTINA AND ABROAD WILL HAVE TO FACE THE LIKELIHOOD THAT MISSING FRIENDS AND RELATIVES MUST BE PRESUMED DEAD. THIS WILL CREATE SOME POLITICAL PRESSURES WITHIN ARGENTINA, BUT LIKELY WILL NOT HAVE A MAJOR DOMESTIC POLITICAL IMPACT. IT WILL ALSO GENERATE PRESSURES AND CAMPAIGNS SEEKING TO FORCE THE GOA TO RENDER AN ACCOUNTING FOR THE MISSING. THIS SITUATION RAISES THE QUESTION FOR THE USG OF HOW TO REACT. THE EMBASSY RECOMMENDS THAT THE USG SHOULD CONCENTRATE ITS EFFORTS ON THE OPPORTUNITIES CREATED FOR CONTINUED PROGRESS TOWARD RETURN TO THE RULE OF LAW. WHILE NOT CONDONING OR

ARGENTINA PROJECT (S200000044)
U.S. DEPT. OF STATE, A/RPS/IPS
Margaret P. Graefeld, Director

Release: ( ) Excise: ( ) Deny
Exemption(s):

Declassify: ( ) In Part

( ) Classify as: ( ) Extend as: ( ) Downgrade to

Date: ________
Declassify on: ________
Reason: ________

PAGE 02 BUENOS 02234 01 OF 03 281927Z

PARDONING THE GOA FOR ITS PART IN THE DISAPPEARANCES, WE SHOULD AVOID ENDORSING DEMANDS FOR AN ACCOUNTING.
END SUMMARY

2. CIVIL VIOLENCE, TERRORISM AND COUNTERTERRORISM IN ARGENTINA OVER THE PAST HALF-DOZEN YEARS HAVE PROBABLY TAKEN THOUSANDS OF LIVES. A GREAT MANY OF THOSE HAVE BEEN SHOT OR VICTIMS OF BOMB ATTACKS. THERE IS A LARGE CATEGORY, HOWEVER, GENERALLY DESCRIBED AS "THE DISAPPEARED". THE CONVENTIONAL GOVERNMENT EXPLANATION FOR THESE PERSONS WHO HAVE VANISHED WITHOUT A TRACE IS THAT THEY:

(1) HAVE GONE UNDERGROUND.
(2) WERE TERRORISTS WHO WERE KILLED BY THEIR COMPANIONS.
(3) HAVE FLED THE COUNTRY.
(4) HAD BEEN KILLED IN BATTLE AND BODIES WERE UNRECOGNIZABLE, OR
(5) WERE THE VICTIMS OF COUNTER-SUBVERSIVE EXCESSES.

WHILE WE KNOW THAT THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT NUMBERS IN THE FIRST FOUR CATEGORIES, WE ARE CONVINCED THAT THE MAJORITY FALL IN THE FIFTH. THESE INDIVIDUALS HAVE BEEN SEIZED BY ELEMENTS OF THE SECURITY FORCES AND HAVE BEEN SUMMARILY EXECUTED WHEN IT IS FOUND OR STRONGLY SUSPECTED THAT THEY HAVE SERIOUS INVOLVEMENT WITH TERRORISM.

3. THE MAGNITUDE OF THE PROBLEM:
AN ACCURATE NUMBER CAN NEVER BE ARRIVED AT. ORGANIZATIONS WHICH REGISTER REPORTS OF DISAPPEARANCES HAVE COLLECTED WIDELY VARYING NUMBER OF CASES. IT IS OUR ESTIMATE THAT AT LEAST SEVERAL THOUSAND WERE KILLED, AND WE DOUBT THAT IT WILL EVER BE POSSIBLE TO CONSTRUCT A MORE SPECIFIC FIGURE.

POWER ON GROUNDS OF SUBVERSIVE ACTIVITY OR SUSPECTED ACTIVITY. AT THIS POINT, ALL BUT ABOUT 800 OF THE 3,700 PRISONERS IN THIS CATEGORY HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED BY THE GOA. WHEN THE NAMES OF THE REMAINING 800 HAS BEEN PUBLISHED, ALL THOSE MISSING WHOSE NAMES HAVE NOT TURNED UP ON THE LISTS (AS SOME 70 HAVE) WILL HAVE TO BE PRESUMED DEAD. THEIR FRIENDS CAN NO LONGER CLING TO THE HOPE THAT THEY WERE UNDER SECRET GOVERNMENT DETENTION.

5. COMPLETENESS OF THE GOVERNMENT'S LISTS:
IT IS INEVITABLE THAT SOME WILL CONTINUE TO CONTEND THAT THOUSANDS OF PRISONERS ARE BEING HELD IN SECRET PRISON CAMPS OR THAT FOR SPECIAL REASONS THE GOVERNMENT HAS DECLINED TO IDENTIFY SOME INDIVIDUALS IT IS HOLDING. THE EMBASSY DOUBTS THAT THIS COULD ACCOUNT FOR A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER. WE KNOW THAT THERE IS A SMALL NUMBER OF CAPTURED TERRORISTS WHO ARE COOPERATING WITH THE AUTHORITIES AGAINST THEIR FORMER COMRADES AND WHOSE NAMES ARE WITHHELD FOR THEIR PROTECTION. THERE MAY BE SMALL NUMBERS OF OTHER PRISONERS SECRETLY RETAINED FOR SPECIAL REASONS, BUT THERE IS NO INCENTIVE OR
6. THE PROBLEM FOR THE GOA:
THOSE WHO HAVE BEEN MAINTAINING THE HOPE THAT DISAPPEARED
RELATIVES MAY TURN UP WILL FEEL THEIR SENSE OF LOSS
ACUTELY. THE ONE-ISSUE GROUPS, SUCH AS THE
MOTHERS OF THE PLAZA DE MAYO, WILL CLAMOR FOR THE
GOVERNMENT TO MAKE AN ACCOUNTING FOR THE MISSING.
THE ISSUE WILL BE INCREASINGLY AND DRAMATICALLY
REPORTED INTERNATIONALLY. HOWEVER, WE DOUBT THAT
IT WILL ASSUME SIGNIFICANT DOMESTIC POLITICAL
PROPORTIONS; THE GOVERNMENT RETAINS SUBSTANTIAL
PUBLIC SUPPORT AND THERE IS NO SIGNIFICANT ORGANIZED
OPPOSITION. THERE IS NO GENERAL PERVERSIVE SENSE
OF OUTRAGE ABOUT THOSE WHO HAVE DISAPPEARED, AND,
INDEED, AMONG THOSE WHO HAVE NOT LOST RELATIVES—AND
EVEN AMONG SOME WHO HAVE—A FREQUENT REACTION IS
"GOOD RIDDANCE". THE ISSUE HAS SHOWN POLITICAL
POTENTIAL, HOWEVER, IN THAT ADMIRAL MASSERA HAS
MADE A FEW GESTURES AT EXPLOITING IT FOR
HIS PERSONAL POLITICAL ADVANTAGE AND WHEN GREATER

7. THE GOA REACTION:
The GOA HAS LONG SINCE DECIDED HOW TO DEAL WITH THE
PROBLEM OF DISAPPEARANCES. IT HAS ESTABLISHED
A FRAMEWORK TO EXPLAIN THE DISAPPEARANCES AND HAS
NOT DENIED THAT WHEN THE LAST OF THE LISTS OF
DETAINEES UNDER THE EXECUTIVE AUTHORITY IS PUBLISHED,
THOSE NOT LISTED CAN BE ASSUMED LOST INTO ONE OF
THE FIVE CATEGORIES OF THE DISAPPEARED. THE GOA'S
LEADERS HAVE DECIDED TO RIDE OUT THIS ISSUE. WE
THINK THEY HAVE CONCLUDED THAT IT CAN BE DONE
WITHOUT SIGNIFICANT DOMESTIC POLITICAL RISK. WE
CAN EXPECT THE GOA SPOKESMEN IN THE UN AND OTHER
INTERNATIONAL FORA TO DEAL WITH THE DISAPPEARANCE
PROBLEM BY CITING THE FIVE REASONS FOR DISAPPEARANCES
WHENEVER THE SUBJECT IS RAISED. THE PUBLICATIONS
OF THE LISTS OF DETAINES, HOWEVER, TOGETHER WITH
THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RIGHT OF OPTION (VOLUNTARY
EXILE) PROGRAM HAVE SET THE STAGE FOR FURTHER
MODIFICATIONS OF THE GOA COUNTER-TERRORIST PRACTICES.
THESE MOVES, MINIMAL THOUGH THEY BE, CREATE SOME
MOMENTUM IN THE DIRECTION OF A RETURN TO DUE
PROCESS AND NORMALITY. WE ALREADY SEE-AS IN THE
CHURCH'S LETTER TO THE GOVERNMENT--GROWING
PRESSURES TO CHARGE OR FREE THOSE HELD UNDER THE
EXECUTIVE AUTHORITY AND TO CEASE THE IRREGULAR
DETENTION PRACTICES (ABDUCTION) REGULARLY USED
BY THE SECURITY FORCES.

8. THE PROBLEM FOR THE UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT:

WHEN EVENTS REQUIRE THAT THERE BE PUBLIC ACKNOWLEDGMENT
OF MANY THOUSANDS OF PRESUMED DEAD IN ARGENTINA,
THE USG WILL HAVE TO COMMENT ON THE SITUATION IN
DEALING WITH CONGRESS AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS,
HUMAN RIGHTS GROUPS, AND PARTICULARLY FRIENDS AND
RELATIVES OF THE MISSING. THE EMBASSY RECOMMENDS
THAT THE US AVOID SUPPORTING DEMANDS THAT THE GOA ACCOUNT
FOR THE MISSING. WE BELIEVE THIS WOULD BE FRUITLESS
AND MIGHT DIVERT US FROM THE OPPORTUNITY THAT LIES
IN THE CURRENT SITUATION. THE EFFORT WOULD BE
FRUITLESS BECAUSE WE BELIEVE THAT THE GOA FEELS
ITS CURRENT POSITION IS LESS RISKY THAN FUTURE PUBLICATION
OF NECESSARILY INCOMPLETE LISTS OF THOSE EXECUTED BY THE SECURITY
FORCES. EVEN IF IT SHOULD CHOOSE TO PUBLISH LISTS,
THEIR OMISSIONS WOULD GENERATE FURTHER CONTROVERSY.
THE GOA COUNTER-TERRORIST OPERATIONS WERE
DELIBERATELY ORGANIZED WITH A HIGH DEGREE OF
INDEPENDENCE OF INDIVIDUAL UNITS, PARTICULARLY IN
THE FIRST YEAR FOLLOWING THE REVOLUTION. THIS WAS
DONE PARTLY TO COMPARTMENTALIZE THE OPERATIONS
AND PROTECT THEM FROM TERRORIST PENETRATION, BUT
IT WAS ALSO DONE SO THAT THE GOA MIGHT MAKE A
PLAUSIBLE DENIAL OF ANY PARTICULAR OPERATION. WE
SUSPECT THAT, EVEN IF THE GOVERNMENT HAS TRIED TO
MAINTAIN SOME RECORDS OF EXECUTIONS, THE METHOD
BY WHICH IT ORGANIZED ITS TROOPS ALMOST GUARANTEES
THAT REPORTS WOULD BE UNRELIABLE. IT IS ALSO
IMPORTANT TO BEAR IN MIND THAT THE GOA HAS ACCEPTED
RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE DEATHS OF SOME OF THE
PERSONS DISAPPEARED AND, CONSEQUENTLY, ADMITS A
BURDEN OF GUILT, ALBEIT VASTLY UNDERSTATE. THE
EMBASSY RECOMMENDS THAT IN CORRESPONDENCE AND PUBLIC
STATEMENTS ABOUT THE PROBLEM OF THOSE MISSING IN
ARGENTINA, THE USG AVOID LANGUAGE THAT WOULD
STIGMATIZE THIS GOVERNMENT AND INSTEAD FOCUS ATTENTION ON
THE PROSPECTS FOR IMPROVED OBSERVANCE OF HUMAN
RIGHTS IN ARGENTINA.

9. THE OPPORTUNITY FOR THE U.S.:
THE PUBLICATION OF THE LISTS OF POLITICAL PRISONERS
IS IN A SENSE A WATERSHED EVENT. THE GOVERNMENT
HAS DROPPED THE VEIL OF SECRECY FROM ONE IMPORTANT ASPECT
OF ITS SECURITY PROGRAM. WITH THE WAR AGAINST SUBVERSION
ACKNOWLEDGED AS WON BY ALL BUT A FEW HARDLINERS,
IT SHOULD BECOME INCREASINGLY DIFFICULT TO JUSTIFY
THOSE ABDUCTION PRACTICES STILL USED BY THE SECURITY
FORCES IN THEIR OPERATIONS. THE US RESPONSE SHOULD
BE TO REINFORCE THE MOMENTUM TOWARD NORMALIZATION
AND DUE PROCESS. IN THIS CONTEXT, PRESSING FOR

NNN

PAGE 01 BUENOS 02234 03 OF 03 281645Z
ACTION ARA-14

INFO OCT-01 IO-13 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-05 H-01
INR-10 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05 PA-01 SP-02 SS-15
USIA-06 HA-05 TRSE-00 MCT-01 /082 W
-----------------------------013893 281951Z /72

R 281213Z MAR 78
FM AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 5076
INFO 'AMEMBASSY ASUNCION
AMEMBASSY BRASILIA

Current Class: [REDACTED]
Current Handling: n/a
Document Number: 1978BUENOS02234

PAGE 04 BUENOS 02234 02 OF 03 281640Z.
AN ACCOUNTING OF THE MISSING WOULD BE A DIVERSION.

10. THE EMBASSY RECOMMENDS THAT ON AN EARLY
CONVENIENT OCCASION A RANKING DEPARTMENT OFFICIAL
COMMENT ON THE PUBLICATION OF THE DETENTION LISTS,
THE RIGHT OF OPTION PROGRAM (AND, POSSIBLY THE
DEUTSCH AND TIMERMAN RELEASES), STRESSING OUR
HOPE THAT THEY ARE BUT EARLY STEPS TOWARD THE RULE
OF LAW. THE PUBLIC STATEMENT SHOULD BE COMPLEMENTED
BY HIGH-LEVEL PRIVATE DEMARCHES IN BOTH WASHINGTON
AND BUENOS AIRES. THESE WOULD NOT THE PUBLIC
STATEMENT BUT HEAVILY QUALIFY IT, AND OBSERVE THAT
US PUBLIC OPINION, FOR ONE, WILL NOT TOLERATE
MOVES FOR AN IMPROVEMENT IN BILATERAL RELATIONS
WHILE THE IRREGULAR ARREST
PROCEDURES AND DETENTIONS WITHOUT CHARGE CONTINUE.
AT THIS TIME IT SHOULD ALSO BE STRESSED THAT THE
ISSUE OF THE DISAPPEARED WILL NEVER GO AWAY
SO LONG AS THE GOA CONTINUES THOSE PRACTICES WHICH

ARE DIRECTLY ASSOCIATED WITH MANY DISAPPEARANCES.
THE DEMARCHE COULD USEFULLY SET FORTH SOME
SPECIFIC REFORMS WHICH WOULD PERMIT THE USG TO
ABSTAIN ON FURTHER IFI VOTES ON ARGENTINE LOANS.
WE SHOULD CONCENTRATE ON THE ARREST PROCEDURES AT
THIS STAGE, FOR THEY ARE THE MECHANISM FOR THE
WORST ABUSES. WE SHOULD AVOID PRESSING FOR
INDIVIDUAL RELEASES--A TACTIC WHICH THE GOA HAS
SUCCESSFULLY USED TO BLUNT THE FORCE OF THE
USG PRESSURES--AND SHOULD AVOID DEMANDING
ACCOUNTABILITY FOR THE DISAPPEARED, SINCE
THAT DOES NOTHING DIRECTLY TO ELIMINATE FURTHER ABUSES.

11. THE DEPARTMENT'S COMMENTS WOULD BE APPRECIATED.
CASTRO