Memorandum

To: Service Directorate
From: Acting Deputy Director, K Adams, Nov. 7, 2001

Subject: New Attorney General Memorandum on the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)

Attached is the subject memorandum, from Attorney General John Ashcroft that supersedes an October 4, 1993, memorandum by former Attorney General Janet Reno.

The previous Attorney General's policy

On October 4, 1993, Attorney General Reno issued a memorandum outlining government policy related to the disclosure of information under the FOIA. In that memo the Attorney General recognized the importance of an informed citizenry and the role of FOIA in maintaining the principle of openness in government and asserted the following:

1) FOIA is a law whose presumption is on disclosure.
2) The Department of Justice would no longer defend an agency's withholding merely because there was a "substantial legal basis" for doing so.
3) Instead, there must be a specific reference to harm to an interest protected by the exemption used.
4) There is an emphasis on "discretionary disclosures" (we disclose information even though technically there is an exemption that can be applied).
5) Agencies had a 'reasonable segregation' obligation under the FOIA (i.e., the agency must attempt to separate factual information from predecisional and deliberative information).

The current Attorney General's policy

Attorney General John Ashcroft's October 12, 2001, memorandum, is similar in that it recognizes the following: the importance of a well-informed citizenry, the FOIA's role in preserving government accountability, the opportunity for 'discretionary disclosures'; and the obligation to 'reasonably segregate' factual information from predecisional and deliberative information. However it emphasizes the following.
1) There is a need to safeguard national security, enhance the effectiveness of law enforcement operations, protect sensitive business information, and preserve personal privacy.

2) Confidential advice and counsel prepared in the conduct of agency deliberations must be preserved to operate effectively.

3) ‘Discretionary disclosures’ may be made but only after full and deliberate consideration of the institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests.

How does this affect your processing of FOIA requests?

Attorney General Ashcroft’s memorandum establishes a shift in FOIA policy and does the following.

1) It preserves the opportunity for ‘discretionary disclosures’ but does not establish a presumption for such disclosures.

2) It allows ‘discretionary disclosures’ of information only after a thorough analysis of the effects upon institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interest; and in consultation with and under surname of the Office of the Solicitor.

3) It eliminates the need to prepare a ‘forseeable harm statement’ related to exemption 5 (predecisional and deliberative) withholdings.

4) It reinvigorates the application of exemption 2 (circumvention of internal agency rules and procedures) in order to withhold institutional information.

We wish to emphasize that the shift related to release of information under the FOIA has moved from the presumption of ‘discretionary disclosure’ of information to the need to safeguard institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests. The application of Attorney General Ashcroft’s policy will be further defined by the interpretation of future case law. This information will be provided to bureau FOIA contacts as soon as it becomes available.

All other procedures including, the requirements to seek review from the Office of the Solicitor and to provide the requester appeal rights when withholding information are still in effect. If you have further questions or need additional information, please contact the Service FOIA Officer, Johnny Hunt, on 703/358-2504.

Attachment
MEMORANDUM FOR HEADS OF ALL FEDERAL DEPARTMENTS AND AGENCIES

FROM: John Ashcroft
Attorney General

SUBJECT: The Freedom of Information Act

As you know, the Department of Justice and this Administration are committed to full compliance with the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552 (2000). It is only through a well-informed citizenry that the leaders of our nation remain accountable to the governed and the American people can be assured that neither fraud nor government waste is concealed.

The Department of Justice and this Administration are equally committed to protecting other fundamental values that are held by our society. Among them are safeguarding our national security, enhancing the effectiveness of our law enforcement agencies, protecting sensitive business information and, not least, preserving personal privacy.

Our citizens have a strong interest as well in a government that is fully functional and efficient. Congress and the courts have long recognized that certain legal privileges ensure candid and complete agency deliberations without fear that they will be made public. Other privileges ensure that lawyers' deliberations and communications are kept private. No leader can operate effectively without confidential advice and counsel. Exemption 5 of the FOIA, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5), incorporates these privileges and the sound policies underlying them.

I encourage your agency to carefully consider the protection of all such values and interests when making disclosure determinations under the FOIA. Any discretionary decision by your agency to disclose information protected under the FOIA should be made only after full and deliberate consideration of the institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests that could be implicated by disclosure of the information.

In making these decisions, you should consult with the Department of Justice's Office of Information and Privacy when significant FOIA issues arise, as well as with our Civil Division on FOIA litigation matters. When you carefully consider FOIA requests and decide to withhold records, in whole or in part, you can be assured that the Department of Justice will defend your decisions unless they lack a sound legal basis or present an unwarranted risk of adverse impact on the ability of other agencies to protect other important records.

This memorandum supersedes the Department of Justice's FOIA Memorandum of October 4, 1993, and it likewise creates no substantive or procedural right enforceable at law.
In Reply Refer To:
FWS/PDM

Memorandum

To: Acting Service Directorate
From: Deputy Director Kevin Adams  NOV 7 2001

Subject: New Attorney General Memorandum on the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)

Attached is the subject memorandum, from Attorney General John Ashcroft that supersedes an October 4, 1993, memorandum by former Attorney General Janet Reno.

The previous Attorney General's policy

On October 4, 1993, Attorney General Reno issued a memorandum outlining government policy related to the disclosure of information under the FOIA. In that memo the Attorney General recognized the importance of an informed citizenry and the role of FOIA in maintaining the principle of openness in government and asserted the following:

1) FOIA is a law whose presumption is on disclosure.
2) The Department of Justice would no longer defend an agency’s withholding merely because there was a “substantial legal basis” for doing so.
3) Instead, there must be a specific reference to harm to an interest protected by the exemption used.
4) There is an emphasis on “discretionary disclosures” (we disclose information even though technically there is an exemption that can be applied).
5) Agencies had a ‘reasonable segregation’ obligation under the FOIA (i.e., the agency must attempt to separate factual information from predecisional and deliberative information).

The current Attorney General’s policy

Attorney General John Ashcroft’s October 12, 2001, memorandum, is similar in that it recognizes the following: the importance of a well-informed citizenry, the FOIA’s role in preserving government accountability, the opportunity for ‘discretionary disclosures’; and the obligation to ‘reasonably segregate’ factual information from predecisional and deliberative information. However it emphasizes the following.
1) There is a need to safeguard national security, enhance the effectiveness of law enforcement operations, protect sensitive business information, and preserve personal privacy.

2) Confidential advice and counsel prepared in the conduct of agency deliberations must be preserved to operate effectively.

3) ‘Discretionary disclosures’ may be made but only after full and deliberate consideration of the institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests.

**How does this affect your processing of FOIA requests?**

Attorney General Ashcroft’s memorandum establishes a shift in FOIA policy and does the following.

1) It preserves the opportunity for ‘discretionary disclosures’ but does not establish a presumption for such disclosures.

2) It allows ‘discretionary disclosures’ of information only after a thorough analysis of the effects upon institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interest; and in consultation with and under surname of the Office of the Solicitor.

3) It eliminates the need to prepare a ‘forseeable harm statement’ related to exemption 5 (predecisional and deliberative) withholdings.

4) It reinvigorates the application of exemption 2 (circumvention of internal agency rules and procedures) in order to withhold institutional information.

We wish to emphasize that the shift related to release of information under the FOIA has moved from the presumption of ‘discretionary disclosure’ of information to the need to safeguard institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests. The application of Attorney General Ashcroft’s policy will be further defined by the interpretation of future case law. This information will be provided to bureau FOIA contacts as soon as it becomes available.

All other procedures including, the requirements to seek review from the Office of the Solicitor and to provide the requester appeal rights when withholding information are still in effect. If you have further questions or need additional information, please contact the Service FOIA Officer, Johnny Hunt, on 703/358-2504.

**Attachment**

Cc:    Directorate Reading File
       DDChron
       ABHR Reading File
       PDM FOIA File

_fws/pdm/jhunt/diskfy2002/ashcroft1/10/29/01_
In Reply Refer To:
FWS/PDM

Memorandum

To: Acting Service Directorate
From: Deputy Director Kevin Adams NOV - 7 2001

Subject: New Attorney General Memorandum on the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)

Attached is the subject memorandum, from Attorney General John Ashcroft that supersedes an October 4, 1993, memorandum by former Attorney General Janet Reno.

The previous Attorney General's policy

On October 4, 1993, Attorney General Reno issued a memorandum outlining government policy related to the disclosure of information under the FOIA. In that memo the Attorney General recognized the importance of an informed citizenry and the role of FOIA in maintaining the principle of openness in government and asserted the following:

1) FOIA is a law whose presumption is on disclosure.
2) The Department of Justice would no longer defend an agency's withholding merely because there was a "substantial legal basis" for doing so.
3) Instead, there must be a specific reference to harm to an interest protected by the exemption used.
4) There is an emphasis on "discretionary disclosures" (we disclose information even though technically there is an exemption that can be applied).
5) Agencies had a 'reasonable segregation' obligation under the FOIA (i.e., the agency must attempt to separate factual information from predecisional and deliberative information).

The current Attorney General's policy

Attorney General John Ashcroft's October 12, 2001, memorandum, is similar in that it recognizes the following: the importance of a well-informed citizenry, the FOIA's role in preserving government accountability, the opportunity for 'discretionary disclosures'; and the obligation to 'reasonably segregate' factual information from predecisional and deliberative information. However it emphasizes the following.
1) There is a need to safeguard national security, enhance the effectiveness of law enforcement operations, protect sensitive business information, and preserve personal privacy.

2) Confidential advice and counsel prepared in the conduct of agency deliberations must be preserved to operate effectively.

3) 'Discretionary disclosures' may be made but only after full and deliberate consideration of the institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests.

How does this affect your processing of FOIA requests?

Attorney General Ashcroft’s memorandum establishes a shift in FOIA policy and does the following.

1) It preserves the opportunity for ‘discretionary disclosures’ but does not establish a presumption for such disclosures.

2) It allows ‘discretionary disclosures’ of information only after a thorough analysis of the effects upon institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interest; and in consultation with and under surname of the Office of the Solicitor.

3) It eliminates the need to prepare a ‘foreseeable harm statement’ related to exemption 5 (predecisional and deliberative) withholdings.

4) It reinvigorates the application of exemption 2 (circumvention of internal agency rules and procedures) in order to withhold institutional information.

We wish to emphasize that the shift related to release of information under the FOIA has moved from the presumption of ‘discretionary disclosure’ of information to the need to safeguard institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests. The application of Attorney General Ashcroft’s policy will be further defined by the interpretation of future case law. This information will be provided to bureau FOIA contacts as soon as it becomes available.

All other procedures including, the requirements to seek review from the Office of the Solicitor and to provide the requester appeal rights when withholding information are still in effect. If you have further questions or need additional information, please contact the Service FOIA Officer, Johnny Hunt, on 703/358-2504.

Attachment

Cc: Directorate Reading File
    DDChron
    ABHR Reading File
    PDM FOIA File

fwspdm/jhunt/diskfy2002/ashcroft/10/29/01
MEMORANDUM FOR HEADS OF ALL FEDERAL DEPARTMENTS AND AGENCIES

FROM: John Ashcroft  
Attorney General

SUBJECT: The Freedom of Information Act

As you know, the Department of Justice and this Administration are committed to full compliance with the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552 (2000). It is only through a well-informed citizenry that the leaders of our nation remain accountable to the governed and the American people can be assured that neither fraud nor government waste is concealed.

The Department of Justice and this Administration are equally committed to protecting other fundamental values that are held by our society. Among them are safeguarding our national security, enhancing the effectiveness of our law enforcement agencies, protecting sensitive business information and, not least, preserving personal privacy.

Our citizens have a strong interest as well in a government that is fully functional and efficient. Congress and the courts have long recognized that certain legal privileges ensure candid and complete agency deliberations without fear that they will be made public. Other privileges ensure that lawyers' deliberations and communications are kept private. No leader can operate effectively without confidential advice and counsel. Exemption 5 of the FOIA, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5), incorporates these privileges and the sound policies underlying them.

I encourage your agency to carefully consider the protection of all such values and interests when making disclosure determinations under the FOIA. Any discretionary decision by your agency to disclose information protected under the FOIA should be made only after full and deliberate consideration of the institutional, commercial, and personal privacy interests that could be implicated by disclosure of the information.

In making these decisions, you should consult with the Department of Justice's Office of Information and Privacy when significant FOIA issues arise, as well as with our Civil Division on FOIA litigation matters. When you carefully consider FOIA requests and decide to withhold records, in whole or in part, you can be assured that the Department of Justice will defend your decisions unless they lack a sound legal basis or present an unwarranted risk of adverse impact on the ability of other agencies to protect other important records.

This memorandum supersedes the Department of Justice's FOIA Memorandum of October 4, 1993, and it likewise creates no substantive or procedural right enforceable at law.
NOTE TO REVIEWERS

- Attorney General Ashcroft recently issued his new policy regarding the implementation of FOIA under the current administration.

- The new policy emphasizes a shift from presumption of discretionary release to a more careful analysis of the institutional effects regarding release of information in response to a FOIA request.

- The Department held a meeting where the Office of the Solicitor discussed the new policy and the effects it would have upon the processing of FOIA requests.

- The Division of Policy and Directives Management was tasked by the Director with issuing guidance to the Service Directorate.

- The attached guidance has received Solicitors Office review. They concurred with our assessment and guidance and indicated that this is a developing area that will be further defined by future case-law.

Program Contact: Johnny Hunt (703/358-2504)
**FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE**
**DOCUMENT TRACKING CONTROL SLIP**

**DCN:** 005496  
**ES No:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Orig. Office:</th>
<th>Received Date:</th>
<th>Address:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABHR-PDM</td>
<td>10/29/2001</td>
<td>Service Directorate,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Due Date:</th>
<th>Signature Level:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Subject:**  
New Attorney General Memorandum on the FOIA

**Comments:**

**Action Codes:**

- 0 - Prepare Draft Reply
- 1 - Prepare Reply
- 2 - Appropriate Action
- 3 - Surname
- 4 - Signature
- 5 - Review/Comment
- 6 - Revise
- 7 - Obtain Additional Surnames
- 8 - Other - See Comments
- 9 - Mail/Distribute
- 10 - Finalize
- 11 - Simultaneous Surnames

**Routing:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Routed To</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Assigned Date</th>
<th>BF DATE</th>
<th>Returned Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABHR-PDM</td>
<td>3 - Surname</td>
<td>10/29/2001</td>
<td></td>
<td>10/29/2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABHR</td>
<td>3 - Surname</td>
<td>10/29/2001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCU</td>
<td>2 - Appropriate Action</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABHR-PDM</td>
<td>9 - Mail/Distribute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Routing Log]

- **CCU** 2 11/7/01
- **ABHR** 9 11/7/01
- **PDM** 9 11/7/01
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TO</th>
<th>MAIL STOP</th>
<th>TO</th>
<th>MAIL STOP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D  DIRECTOR/DEPUTY DIRECTOR</td>
<td>3012 MIB</td>
<td>OIM Office of Information Technology &amp; Mgmt</td>
<td>670 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALE ASST DIRECTOR - LAW ENFORCEMENT</td>
<td>3250 MIB</td>
<td>DVSC Division of Visitor Servs &amp; Communications</td>
<td>670 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LE Office of Law Enforcement</td>
<td>520 ARL</td>
<td>AFHC ASST DIRECTOR - FISHERIES &amp; HABITAT CONSERVATION</td>
<td>3245 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEA ASST DIRECTOR - EXTERNAL AFFAIRS</td>
<td>3251 MIB</td>
<td>OBO Office of Program Operations</td>
<td>820 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAEA Deputy Assistant Director</td>
<td>3251 MIB</td>
<td>FHS Division of the National Fish Hatchery System</td>
<td>840 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA Division of Public Affairs</td>
<td>3359 MIB</td>
<td>MAHR Division of Fish and Wildlife Mgmt. Assistance &amp; Habitat Restoration</td>
<td>840 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLA Division of Congressional &amp; Legislative Affairs</td>
<td>3038 MIB</td>
<td>FPA Division of Federal Program Activities</td>
<td>400 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCTC National Conservation Training Center</td>
<td>3012 MIB</td>
<td>EQ Division of Environmental Quality</td>
<td>322 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAL Native American Liaison</td>
<td>3251 MIB</td>
<td>AES ASST DIRECTOR - ENDANGERED SPECIES</td>
<td>3242 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RC Research Coordinator</td>
<td>850 ARL</td>
<td>DAES Deputy Assistant Director</td>
<td>3242 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABMO ASST DIRECTOR - BUSINESS MANAGEMENT &amp; OPERATIONS</td>
<td>3022 MIB</td>
<td>OPS Office of Program Support</td>
<td>330 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGS Division of Contracting &amp; General Services</td>
<td>212 ARL</td>
<td>DCC Division of Conservation &amp; Classification</td>
<td>420 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRM Division of Information Resources Management</td>
<td>340 ARL</td>
<td>DCHR Division of Consultation, HCPs &amp; Recovery</td>
<td>420 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DF Division of Finance/Payroll</td>
<td>380 ARL</td>
<td>OPO Office of Partnerships and Outreach</td>
<td>420 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECN Division of Economics</td>
<td>224 ARL</td>
<td>AIA ASST DIRECTOR - INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS</td>
<td>3245 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BES Branch of Engineering Services</td>
<td>300 ARL</td>
<td>DAIA Deputy Assistant Director</td>
<td>700 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSHA Division of Safety, Health and Aviation</td>
<td>300 ARL</td>
<td>DIC Division of International Conservation</td>
<td>730 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR Division of Human Resources</td>
<td>3458 MIB</td>
<td>DNA Division of Management Authority</td>
<td>700 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DP-W</td>
<td>Division of Budget</td>
<td>3559 MIB</td>
<td>DSA Division of Scientific Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DB Division of Budget</td>
<td>3559 MIB</td>
<td>AMBS ASST DIRECTOR - MIGRATORY BIRDS &amp; STATE PROGRAMS</td>
<td>3250 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCR Division of Diversity and Civil Rights</td>
<td>300 WEBB</td>
<td>DMBS Deputy Assistant Director</td>
<td>560 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PES Planning and Information Staff</td>
<td>3012 MIB</td>
<td>MBM Div. of Migratory Bird Management</td>
<td>634 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNWR CHIEF, NAT'L WILDLIFE REFUGE SYSTEM</td>
<td>3251 MIB</td>
<td>BHC Div. of Bird Habitat Conservation</td>
<td>110 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DNR Deputy Chief</td>
<td>670 ARL</td>
<td>FDSD Federal Duck Stamp Division</td>
<td>2058 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RE Division of Realty</td>
<td>622 ARL</td>
<td>FA Division of Federal Aid</td>
<td>140 ARL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DNP Division of Natural Resources</td>
<td>670 ARL</td>
<td>CPLD Conservation Partnerships Liaison Div.</td>
<td>132AWEBB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCP Division of Conservation Planning &amp; Policy</td>
<td>670 ARL</td>
<td>SOL-CW Solicitor, Div. of Conservation &amp; Wildlife</td>
<td>6560 MIB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOB Division of Nat'l Wildlife Refuge System Budget</td>
<td>670 ARL</td>
<td>SOL-GL Solicitor, Div. of General Law</td>
<td>6531 MIB</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Remarks:**

FROM: ________________________

TELEPHONE: ______________________

DATE: ______________________